



In-Service Training and Its Effect on the Implementation of Play-Based Learning in ECE Classrooms

Dr. Kiran Akhtar¹, Dr. Ali Gul Bugti², Dr. Um E Rubab³, Erum Noreen⁴ & Dr. Sidra Kiran⁵

¹Lecturer Education, Govt Associate College for Women, Dhoke Hassu, Rawalpindi,

Email: kiranakhtar123@hotmail.com

²Assistant Professor, Department of Education, University of Sufism and Modern Sciences Bhitshah,

Email: dr.aligul@usms.edu.pk

³Assistant Professor, Department of Education, Fatima Jinnah Women University Rawalpindi,

Email: umerubab@fjwu.edu.pk

⁴M.Phil Education, Department of Education, Alhamd Islamic University Islamabad, Pakistan

⁵Assistant Professor, Department of Education, Alhamd Islamic University Islamabad, Pakistan,

Email: sidra.kiran@aiu.edu.pk

ARTICLE INFO

ABSTRACT

Article History:

Received:	February	13, 2025
Revised:	March	26, 2025
Accepted:	April	05, 2025
Available Online:	April	07, 2025

Keywords:

Early Childhood Education, In-Service Training Programme Development, Effectiveness.

Corresponding Author:

Dr. Kiran Akhtar

Email:

kiranakhtar123@hotmail.com



Learning occurs swiftly, particularly in the first few years of life. ECE programs formalize the development of core concepts, abilities, and attitudes that lay the groundwork for school readiness. Training is the most efficient approach for giving in-service trainers with knowledge and thinking and preparing them for their performance profession. Early Childhood Education level is beneficial to children's balanced Social, Mental, Physical, and Cognitive development. Given the importance and effectiveness of ECE, all governments prioritize ECE level programs. In-service training is essential for in-service teachers to deal with new challenges and advancements in the educational field. The purpose of this study is to look into the impact of in-service teacher training on teacher performance at the ECE level, as well as the implementation of in-service teacher training programs in Tehsil Chakwal. The study concentrated on in-service instructors and ECE students. The key goals of the study were to look into the impact of teacher performance and the implementation program in Tehsil Chakwal. The study's population includes all early childhood educators from Tehsil Chakwal's government schools, that is 322. To gather samples from ECEs in Tehsil Chakwal, basic random sampling was used, utilizing a questionnaire as a tool instrument. The equipment was self-designed to meet the research requirements. As a sample, 175 ECEs from government schools were selected. The data was analysed using the Statistical Package for Social Sciences (SPSS). The Social Sciences founded a descriptive technique. To calculate percentages and regressions, SPSS was used. The study revealed that trained teachers have better rapport with children as compared to untrained teachers. Trained teachers are more satisfied than untrained teachers. ECE training has improved teachers' performances and the enrollment of children. Moreover, It contributes to the reduction of dropouts and repeaters at the ECE level.

Introduction

In the dynamic landscape of Early Childhood Education (ECE), the continuous professional development of teachers is paramount to ensuring high-quality learning experiences for young children. In-service training programs have long been recognized as essential avenues for educators to acquire new knowledge, refine pedagogical skills, and stay abreast of evolving educational paradigms. However, the mere participation in such training does not automatically translate to enhanced teaching efficacy or improved student outcomes. It is within this context that reflective practice emerges as a critical component, serving as the bridge between theoretical knowledge gained during training and its practical application in the classroom.

Reflective practice involves a deliberate and structured process wherein educators critically examine their teaching experiences, decisions, and student interactions. This introspective approach fosters self-awareness, promotes continuous learning, and empowers teachers to adapt their methodologies to better meet the diverse needs of their students. By integrating reflective practice into in-service training, ECE teachers can transform passive learning into active, contextually relevant strategies that resonate with their unique classroom environments.

This paper delves into the role of reflective practice in amplifying the effectiveness of in-service training for ECE teachers. Through an exploration of existing literature and empirical studies, we aim to elucidate how reflective practice not only enhances teaching performance but also contributes to the holistic development of educators, ultimately leading to enriched learning experiences for young children.

Reflective practice serves as a cornerstone for professional development in education. By engaging in regular reflection, educators gain deeper insights into their teaching methodologies, student engagements, and the underlying beliefs that shape their instructional decisions. This process of introspection enables teachers to identify areas of strength and pinpoint aspects requiring improvement, fostering a culture of continuous self-improvement and adaptability (Mahnaz et al., 2022a).

A study by Syslová (2019) underscores the significance of reflection in enhancing the quality of preschool teachers' educational performance. The research indicates that teachers who engage in higher levels of reflective practice demonstrate superior teaching performance, emphasizing the direct correlation between reflection and educational quality. Furthermore, the study highlights that educators with advanced degrees tend to exhibit more profound reflective capabilities, suggesting that higher education levels may facilitate deeper introspective practices.

In-service training programs are designed to equip teachers with new skills and knowledge pertinent to their professional roles. However, the effectiveness of these programs is significantly amplified when coupled with reflective practice. Reflection allows educators to contextualize and internalize the information acquired during training, facilitating the translation of theoretical concepts into practical classroom applications (Mahnaz et al., 2022b).

The Early Learning Initiative's continuous professional development (CPD) program serves as a pertinent example. This initiative incorporated reflective practice modules, enabling early childhood care and education practitioners to critically assess their teaching methods and align them with contemporary educational frameworks. Participants reported a transformation in their professional identity, attributing this change to the reflective components of the program that encouraged active evaluation of their practices against established quality standards.

The integration of reflective practice within early childhood education settings offers multifaceted benefits. It encourages educators to adopt a responsive rather than reactive approach to teaching, fostering environments that are attuned to the individual needs of young learners. By contemplating their interactions and instructional strategies, teachers can develop more effective and personalized approaches to student engagement.

ZERO TO THREE, an organization dedicated to early childhood development, emphasizes that reflective practice enables educators to consider the broader context of a child's life, including cultural, familial, and societal influences. This holistic perspective ensures that teaching methods are not only pedagogically sound but also culturally and contextually relevant, thereby enhancing the overall learning experience for children.

While the benefits of reflective practice are well-documented, its implementation within in-service training programs presents certain challenges. Educators may encounter obstacles such as time constraints, lack of institutional support, or insufficient training in reflective methodologies. To overcome these barriers, it is essential to create structured opportunities for reflection within professional development programs (Mahnaz et al., 2025).

Strategies to foster reflective practice include:

1. **Structured Reflection Sessions:** Incorporating dedicated time for reflection during training sessions encourages educators to deliberate on their learning experiences and discuss insights with peers.
2. **Reflective Journals:** Encouraging teachers to maintain journals where they document and analyze their teaching experiences promotes continuous self-assessment and growth.
3. **Peer Collaboration:** Facilitating collaborative reflection among educators fosters a community of practice where experiences and strategies are shared, leading to collective professional advancement.

Addressing these challenges requires a concerted effort from educational institutions to prioritize reflective practice within their professional development frameworks, ensuring that teachers are equipped with the necessary tools and support to engage in meaningful reflection.

Reflective practice stands as a pivotal element in enhancing the impact of in-service training for Early Childhood Education teachers. By fostering a culture of introspection and continuous learning, reflective practice empowers educators to critically assess and refine their teaching methodologies, leading to improved educational outcomes for young children. The integration of reflective practice into professional development programs not only enriches the teaching experience but also cultivates a responsive and adaptive educational environment that is attuned to the evolving needs of both educators and learners.

Objectives of the Study

1. To investigate the impact of in-service training on teacher performance teaching at ECE level.
2. To examine the implementation program of in-service teacher training at ECE level.

Research Questions

- How the teacher practices can be effective teaching at ECE level in Chakwal public school?

- Does the ECE program planned can be benefited and helpful implemented in all govt schools of Tehsil Chakwal?

Significance of the Study

The execution of the Early Childhood Education program in Chakwal requires the government's will and the allocation of financial resources in accordance with the program's requirements. The study material is necessary based on the age level of the Early Childhood Education children (3 to 5). The appointment of a trained teacher at the Early Childhood Education level is also critical to the program's success.

In-service teacher training should be planned with the demands of Early Childhood Education in mind. The continuing professional development program should be designed in such a way that Early Childhood Education teachers receive excellent training in order to effectively teach in Early Childhood Education (Punjab education plan, 2019). The administration of the government school must provide a student-friendly environment.

Literature Review

Reflective practice has garnered significant attention in the field of Early Childhood Education (ECE) as a pivotal mechanism for enhancing teaching efficacy and professional development. This literature review examines contemporary research to elucidate the role of reflective practice in augmenting the impact of in-service training for ECE teachers. The review encompasses various dimensions, including the integration of reflective practice in teacher education programs, its influence on teaching methodologies, and its broader implications for teacher well-being and professional identity (Mahnaz & Kiran 2024a).

Integration of Reflective Practice in Teacher Education Programs

The incorporation of reflective practice into teacher education programs is instrumental in bridging the gap between theoretical knowledge and practical application. Han, Blank, and Berson (2020) conducted a self-study of an early childhood teacher education program undergoing reform to align with national accreditation policies and state certification standards. The study identified core challenges in integrating reflective practice and highlighted approaches to address these issues, emphasizing the necessity of fostering a reflective culture within teacher education to prepare educators for the complexities of contemporary classrooms (Mahnaz & Kiran, 2024a).

Similarly, Recchia and Beck (2014) explored how new early childhood teachers enacted preservice values in their classrooms through reflective practice. Their findings underscored the importance of reflective thinking, child observation, and inquiry in guiding teaching decisions. The study advocated for differentiated instruction and collaboration, facilitated through field experiences that promote reflective engagement, thereby enriching teaching and learning in ECE.

Impact on Teaching Methodologies and Classroom Interactions

Reflective practice significantly influences teaching methodologies and classroom interactions. Cherrington (2018) investigated New Zealand early childhood teachers' thinking and reflection on their teaching interactions. The study revealed that teachers predominantly focused on children's experiences, often overlooking their own teaching intentions and beliefs. This finding suggests a need for professional development programs to encourage educators to critically examine their pedagogical approaches and underlying assumptions.

Chen (2023) conducted a study examining early childhood teachers' reflective instances, focusing on reflection-for-action, reflection-in-action, and reflection-on-action intersecting with technical, practical, and critical dimensions. The research found that reflection-in-action along the practical dimension was most prevalent, indicating that teachers often engage in immediate, experience-based reflection to inform their instructional strategies. The study emphasized the importance of fostering reflective practices that encompass all dimensions to promote comprehensive professional growth (Mahnaz & Kiran, 2024b).

Reflective Practice and Teacher Well-Being

Beyond pedagogical benefits, reflective practice contributes to teacher well-being. Cigala, Venturelli, and Bassetti (2019) implemented a longitudinal training program in Italian early childhood education and care centers, focusing on reflective practice. The study reported improvements in teachers' self-efficacy, sense of belonging, and agency, highlighting reflective practice as a valuable tool for enhancing job satisfaction and reducing work-related stress.

In a related study, Shea, Goldberg, and Weatherston (2018) examined the impact of reflective supervision on early childhood interventionists' perceptions of self-efficacy, job satisfaction, and job stress. The findings indicated significant increases in self-efficacy and positive overall impacts on job satisfaction and professional development, reinforcing the role of reflective practice in supporting workforce development and well-being.

Innovative Approaches to Reflective Practice

Innovative methods, such as digital storytelling, have been employed to promote reflective practice among ECE teachers. A study investigated the use of digital narratives by teachers to reflect on their practices and support migrant and refugee children's sense of belonging. The research demonstrated that digital storytelling facilitated deeper reflection and pedagogical awareness, offering a creative avenue for teachers to examine and enhance their instructional approaches (Mahnaz & Kiran, 2024c).

Challenges and Considerations in Implementing Reflective Practice

Despite its benefits, implementing reflective practice in in-service training presents challenges. These include time constraints, lack of institutional support, and varying levels of teachers' reflective skills. Addressing these challenges requires structured opportunities for reflection, such as dedicated reflection sessions, mentorship programs, and fostering a supportive community of practice. Moreover, integrating reflective practice into the organizational culture necessitates commitment from educational leaders to prioritize and model reflective engagement.

The literature underscores the integral role of reflective practice in enhancing the impact of in-service training for ECE teachers. By fostering critical examination of teaching practices, reflective practice not only improves instructional methodologies but also contributes to teacher well-being and professional identity. Innovative approaches, such as digital storytelling, offer promising avenues for facilitating reflection. However, successful implementation requires addressing inherent challenges through structured support and institutional commitment. Continued research and practice in this area are essential to fully realize the potential of reflective practice in ECE professional development.

Research Methodology

Research Design

In this study the quantitative design is used. The researcher used survey approach to conduct this study. A basic approach that is quantitative the most suitable for dealing with the situation presented in this research. To conduct a actual strategy like quantitative in terms of explaining and analyzing teachers, perception about the in-service teacher training implementation programme.

Population of the research

The population of the research relies on ECE's in-service teacher. According to Chief Executive Officer (CEO) Tehsil Chakwal, there were 322 public schools. All ECE in-service teachers, who were practicing at ECE's level in all government schools, were considered as the population of the research. The study's population consisted of in-service trained ECE teachers. In District Tehsil Chakwal. The list of schools was obtained from the Chief Executive Officer's office district Chakwal.

Sample and sampling technique

Sampling is the demonstration, is away to choosing an adequately modest size of population of decided attributes of entire population, the rundown government schools in the Tehsil Chakwal, was acquired from the D.E.Os of District Chakwal. Tehsil of district Chakwal 10% ECEs was selected for descriptive purpose by Random Sampling. Gay (1996), states that actual investigation of 10-20% population is accurate for dependable.(Gay. L R 6Edition) the researcher used 175 ECEs were taken as sample. Utilizing straight forward arbitrary sampling of average 28 ECEs from each school. To proceed, founded research capable to estimate delayed results of research purpose, requests from the whole population, the right model size was be used in accordance to (L.R Gay 6Edition)

Instrument of the Study

The instrument in this research was questionnaire guided by close-ended questions. The instrument that aligned with the purpose of the study was in-service teacher training performance practicing. The instrument was based on the literature regarding in-service practices, teacher training performance, and role of implementation programme planning. In-service teacher training, and views of impact of training performance practices training support from in-service teachers on school and hurdles during implementation programme. The researcher self-developed questionnaire for this research. The survey (questionnaire) conducted of two parts: Demographics, opinions about in-service training on ECE level, and implementation programme in Tehsil Chakwal.

Development of Questionnaire

After studying the related literature, the following self-developed questionnaire used for this study. A questionnaire with a five-point Likert scale (effective, very effective, average non-effective and highly non-effective) was constructed. The goal of using this rating scale was to investigate methods and provide a rationale for a sample point of view on in-service teacher training. The alternative five-point Likert scale, i.e., agree, strongly agree, neutral, disagree, and strongly disagree, was also prepared for second objective, To examine the implementation of training program at ECE level. The instrument in this study was self-developed questionnaire guided by 26 close ended questions. Self-Designed Questionnaire was used in this study. Which contain:

Part 1. Demographic Information

Part 2 Question 1 to 12 for Data collection for Objective 1
Part 2 Question 13 to 26 for Data collection.

Total 26 Questions were conducted in the Questionnaire.

Validity of Instrument

In order to accuracy of the validity of the questionnaire, opinion of Three educational experts was constructed. The educational experts decided on the content validity and the appropriateness for the target population. Questionnaire was conducting and pilot tested on 28 teachers (other than those who participated in the main study). In order to assess the validity of the research tool and pinpoint potential issues in the field, the researcher conducted a pilot test of the instrument during visits to public ECE schools.

Reliability of Instrument

According to (Drost 2011) "The measurements reliability is the degree to which measurement can be repeated by different individuals under different circumstances, on different occasions and ostensibly with different instruments that measure the same construct or skills. Software called the statistical package for social sciences (SPSS) was utilized in the current study to assess the questionnaire's reliability. By using this software researcher find the value of the Cronbach's Alpha. Cronbach's Alpha is a measure of the consistency of a set of items or a measure of the reliability of a scale. Questionnaire was evaluated in terms of structure, contents and necessary amendments were made accordingly by removing the ambiguous, double-barreled or overlapping items. The finally self-made questionnaire was taken to the field. The Cronbach's alpha value of internal reliability was found to be ($\alpha = 0.71$) in perceptions questionnaire. Participating teachers were taken into confidence by telling them that their scores on instrument would only be used for research process.

Data Collection

Questionnaire for in-service teachers were constructed personally and in-service training introduction was given to the respondents so they could aware about in-service training. A likert scale utilized in this research study was not graphical score such as widely utilized. Each results according as level and the information were required to conclude the level they felt to be best. It was a result of multiplying strongly agrees: S Regarding 5, I agree: In terms of 4, keep 3 undecided: D As for 2 and strongly disagree: SD. As for 1, Data were collected utilizing questionnaire. Since researcher work in the schools of Chakwal (Tehsil), researcher had navigated to respondents' school detail via the chief executive officer (CEO) Chakwal database. However, the CEO provided a list of all ECEs public schools of Chakwal. The 130 volunteers who shown attention in contributing in questionnaire and completed the informed consent form were filled questionnaire. The consent form gather information about in-service teacher training, so participants would know about the importance of in-service training and also ask to me if they had questions before the filling of questionnaire further, contribution in the research is voluntary, and there was no a settlement.

Analysis of Data

The results were computed after interpreting the data. SPSS (V.25) was used to process and analyze each questionnaire item. Data was analyzed using frequencies and percentages, as well as Mode. The data for this study was collected by a questionnaire, which construct of quantitative

data. The results come from the survey's closed-ended questions were summarized using descriptive statistics. Findings were formed, conclusions were drawn, and suggestions were made based on data analysis. Each item's overall Mode was concluded. In order to assess the general quality of each question's responses, the Regression score for each object was decided.

The following scale was utilized to find out R, score: EF=1, HEF=2, AV=3, NE=4, HNE=5, utilities in first objective, SA = 5 score A =4 score NU =3 score DA =2 score SDA =1 score The R, score was conducted using the formula below.

The following formula is employed to calculate percentages: $= F \times 100 / N$ 61 Where: N = All responses received REF= Frequency of Effective responses HEF= Frequency of Highly Effective responses AV=Frequency of Average responses NE= Frequency of Non Effective responses HNE =Frequency of Highly Non Effective ,received tSA = Frequency of strongly agreed responses tA = Frequency of agreed responses tUD=Frequency of undecided responses tD= Frequency of disagreed responses tSD =Frequency of strongly disagreed response.

Table 1: Gender of Teachers

Statement	F	P%	Mode	Std/dv
Male	82	46.6		
Female	93	53.4	1.53	0.001
Total	175	100.0		

Table 1 demonstrates that data was collected from 175 ECEs in Tehsil Chakwal. Out of 175 ECEs, 82 were male teachers and 93 were female teachers. Overall percentage was 46.6% For male teachers and 53.4% for female teachers.

Table 2: Qualification of Teachers

Statement	F	P%	Mode	Std/dv
Matric	16	8.9		
Intermediate	21	8.3		
Graduation	45	17.6	2	.001
Master	75	62.6		
M.phil	18	2.6		
Total		100.0		

Table 2 demonstrates that data was collected from 175 ECE in Tehsil Chakwal. Out of 175 ECE. Overall Percentage of matric teachers 8.9%, Intermediate Teachers8.3%, for Graduation Teachers17.6%, for Masters Teachers 62.6% and for the teachers having M-Phil was 2.6%.

Table 3: Teacher's Experience

Statement	F	P%	Mode	Std/dv
01-05	21	6.7		
		89		

06-10	42	14.8		
11-15	38	13.6	4	1.000
16-20	48	15.9		
21-2	25	6.8		
Total	175	100.0		

Table 3 indicates that data was collected from 175 ECE in Tehsil Chakwal. Out of 175 ECE, Twenty-one teachers have worked for one to five years, 6.7%, forty-two for six to ten years, 14.8%, thirty-eight for eleven to fifteen years, 13.6%, forty-eight for sixteen to twenty years, 15.9%, and twenty-five for twenty-five years. 6.8% and 1.000.std deviation.

Analysis of Objective

Table 4: Investigate the impact of in-service training on teachers performance. (Reported by teachers)

I know how to use different strategies required in teaching at ECE level

Statement	Level	F	P%	Mode	Std/dv
I know how to Use different Strategies required In teaching at ECE level.	NE	16	9.1		
	HNE	20	11.4		
	AV	25	14.4	1	1.00
	EF	56	32		
	HEF	58	33.1		

Table 4 demonstrates that 32% respondents were Effective and 33.1% Highly Effective to the statement that through training teacher know about different strategies at ECE level. Standard deviation 1.00

Table 5: I use practice books for recognition Phonics and other languages activities For ECE level

Statement	Level	F	P%	Mode	Std/dv
I use practice books for recognition Phonics and other Language activities	NE	13	7.4		
	HNE	22	12.5		
	AV	28	16	3.567	0.001
	EF	60	34.3		
	HEF	52	29.7		

Table 5 demonstrates that 34.3% respondents were Effective and also 29.7% Highly Effective to the statement that through training teacher use practice books, phonics, other languages activities R-s is 3.567.

Table 6: ECE training made me aware about helping children to practice reciting poems/ maths tables and reading aloud etc

Statement	Level	F	P%	Mode	Std/dv
ECE training made aware about Helping children to practice reciting Poems/ maths / tables reading aloud etc.	NE	5	2.8		
	HNE	6	33.42		
	AV	18	10.2	2	1.122
	EF	76	43.4		
	HEF	70	40		

Table 6 demonstrates that 76% respondents were Effective and also 70% Highly Effective to the statement that through training teacher practice poem, table, reading aloud. R-v is 1.122.

Table 7: Being ECE trained teacher I make managing their class effectively

Statement	Level	F	P%	Mode	Std/dv
Being ECE trained Teacher I make Managed their class Effectively.	NE	7	4		
	HNE	9	5.14		
	AV	13	7.42	4	1.130
	EF	82	46.8		
	HEF	64	36.5		

Table 7 demonstrates that 46.8% respondents were Effective and also 36.5% Highly Effective to the statement that through training teacher managed their class effectively R-vis 1.130.

Table 8: After ECE training I am able to use classroom materials appropriately

Statement	Level	F	P%	Mode	Std/dv
After ECE training I am able to use Classroom material Appropriately.	NE	14	8		
	HNE	10	5.7		
	AV	19	10.8	2	1.268
	EF	70	40		
	HEF	62	35.4		

Table 8: demonstrates that 40% respondents were Effective and also 35.4% Highly Effective to the statement that through training teacher used classroom material appropriately. R-v is 1.268.

Table 9: After ECE training I am able to manage the interactive classroom setting

Statement	Level	F	P%	Mode	Std/dv
After ECE training I am able to	NE	11	6.2		
	HNE	22	11.4		

Manage the interactive Classroom setting.	AV	34	19.4	4	1.247
	EF	40	22.8		
	HEF	70	40		

Table 9 demonstrates that 40% respondents were Effective and also 70% Highly Effective to the statement that through training teacher managed interactive classroom setting. R-v is 1.247.

Table 10: Through ECE training I know how to prepare contingency plan for unexpected problems

Statement	Level	F	P%	Mode	Std/dv
Through ECE Training I know how to prepareContingency plan For unexpected problems.	NE	7	4		
	HNE	9	5.2		
	AV	13	7.4	3	1.020
	EF	82	46.8		
	HEF	64	36.5		

Table 10 demonstrates that 46.8% respondents were Effective and also 36.5% Highly Effective to the statement that through training teacher prepared contingency plan for unexpected problem. R- vis 1.020

Table 11: Through this in-service training I know how to mold the lesson according to the children level and needs

Statement	Level	F	P%	Mode	Std/dv
Through this in-Service training I Know how to mold the lesson according to the Children level and needs.	NE	9	5.1		
	HNE	12	6.2		
	AV	15	8.5	2	1.298
	EF	64	36.5		
	HEF	76	43.4		

Table 11 demonstrates that 64% respondents were Effective and also 76% Highly Effective to the statement that through training teacher mold the lesson according children need R-v is 1.298

Table 12: Due to ECE training I may help students in developing listings and speaking skills effectively

Statement	Level	F	P%	Mode	Std/dv
Due to ECE training I may help students In developing listings, Speaking, skills	NE	13	7.4		
	HNE	13	7.4		
	AV	28	16		1.130

effectively.	EF	60	34.2	4
	HEF	61	34.8	

Table 12 demonstrates that 34.2% respondents were Effective and also 34.8% Highly Effective to the statement that through training teacher helps children in their developing skills R-v is 1.130.

Table 13: Due to ECE training I may help students to learn how to tracing writing

Statement	Level	F	P%	Mode	Std/dv
Due to ECE training I may help children To learn how to tracing Writing.	NE	8	4.5		
	HEF	9	5.1		
	AV	22	12.5	1	1.143
	EF	68	38.8		
	HEF	68	38.8		

Table 13 demonstrates that 38.8% respondents were Effective and also 38.8% Highly Effective to the statement that through training teacher helps children in tracing writing R-v is 1.143.

Table 14: Due to ECE training I know how to interact with parents in order to improve students' learning

Statement	Level	F	P%	Mode	Std/dv
Due to ECE training I know how to interact with parent in order to improve student learning.	NE	5	2.8		
	HNE	6	3.4		
	AV	15	8.5		1.147
	EF	73	41.7	3	
	HEF	76	43.4		

Table 14 demonstrates that 41.7% respondents were Effective and also 43.4% Highly Effective to the statement that through training teacher interaction with parents to improve children learning effectively. R-s is 1.147.

Table 15: ECE training helps me to cope with students having different behaviour.

Statement	Level	F	P%	Mode	Std/dv
ECE training help Me to cope with Student having Different behavior.	NE	21	12		
	HNE	18	10.2		
	AV	25	14.2	2	1.130
	EF	51	29.1		
	HEF	60	34.2		

Table 15 demonstrates that 29.1% respondents were Effective and also 34.2% Highly Effective to the statement that through training teacher cope with children different behavior. R-s is 1.130.

Table 16: Due to ECE training I am more connected with my students

Statement	Level	F	P%	Mode	Std/dv
Due to ECE training I am more connected With my students	NE	8	4.5		
	HNE	9	5.1		
	AV	18	10.2	2	1.143
	EF	70	40		
	HEF	70	40		

Table 16 demonstrates that 70% respondents were Effective and also 70% Highly Effective to the statement that through training teacher more connected with children R-vis 1.143.

Table 17: Due to ECE training I am being able to tackle those parents who are not able to teach their children at home

Statement	Level	F	P%	Mode	Std/dv
Due to ECE training I ambeing able to tackle those Parents who are not able to teach Their children.	NE	7	4		
	HNE	9	5.1		
	AV	13	7.4	4	1.132
	EF	72	41.1		
	HEF	74	42.2		

Table 17 demonstrates that 41.1% respondents Effective and 42.2 % Highly Effective to the statement that ECE training help teacher, to tackle those parents, who are not able to teach their children R-v is 1.132.

Table 18: In-service training provide teacher support to work on time

Statement	Level	F	P%	Mode	Std/dv
In-service training Provide teacher Support to work On time.	SD	22	12.5		
	D	13	7.4		
	N	32	18.2	2	1.143
	A	60	34.2		
	SA	56	32		

Table 18 demonstrates that 34.2% respondents were agree and also 32% Highly Effective to the statement that through training teacher helps children in tracing writing. R-v is 1.143.

Table 19: I am pleased with the availability of art kit at school for me and all students in my class

Statement	Level	F	P%	Mode	Std/dv
-----------	-------	---	----	------	--------

I am pleased with	SD	8	4.5		
The availability of	D	9	5.1		
Art-kit at school					
For me self and the	N	29	16.5	1	1.270
children in my class.	A	64	36.5		
	SA	65	37.1		

Table 19 demonstrates that 36.5% respondents were agree and also 37.1% strongly agree to the statement that available of art-kit materials for whole class is effective. Std 1.270

Table 20: I am pleased with the availability of basic facilities

Statement	Level	F	P%	Mode	Std/dv
I am pleased with	SD	5	2.8		
The availability of	D	6	3.4		
Basic facilities.					
	N	18	10.2	2	1.318
	A	73	41.7		
	SA	73	41.7		

Table 20 demonstrates that 41.7% respondents were agree and also 41.7% strongly agree to the statement that teacher pleased with the availability of basic facilities. Std 1.318.

Table 21: I am pleased with the In-Service Training opportunities available to me

Statement	Level	F	P%	Mode	Std/dv
I am pleased with the in-	SD	10	5.7		
service Training	D	15	8.5		
opportunities avail					
Able to me.	N	30	17.1	1	1.114
	A	56	32		
	SA	64	36.5		

Table 21 demonstrates that 32% respondents were agree and also 36.5% strongly agree to the statement that teacher pleased with the availability of opportunities. Std, 1.114.

Table 22: I am pleased with the support from the head teachers

Statement	Level	F	P%	Mode	Std/dv
I am pleased with	SD	25	14.2		
The support from	D	31	17.7		
The head instructor.					
	N	27	15.4	1	1.311
	A	50	28.5		
	SA	42	24		

Table 22 demonstrates that 28.5% respondents were agree and also 24% strongly agree to the statement that teacher pleased with the support from Head teacher. Std 1.311

Table 23: Our head teacher lead by example through in-service training at ECE level

Statement	Level	N. F	P%	P%	Std/dv
Our head teacher Lead by example through in-service training at ECE level.	SD	11	6.2		
	D	10	5.7		
	N	31	17.7	3	1.236
	A	55	31.4		
	SA	68	38.8		

Table 23 demonstrates that 31.4% respondents were agree and also 38.8% strongly agree to the statement that Head teacher set example for teacher. Std 1.236.

Table 24: Our head teacher regularly observes classes

Statement	Level	F	P%	Mode	Std/dv
Our head teacher Regularly Observes classes.	SD	8	9.1		
	D	15	11.4		
	N	35	14.4	4	1.194
	A	59	32		
	SA	58	33.1		

Table 24 demonstrates that 32% respondents were agree and also 33.1% strongly agree to the statement that head teacher regularly observes classes. Std 1.194

Table 25: School inspection visits are useful for improving our teaching practice

Statement	Level	F	P%	Mode	Std/dv
School inspection Visits are useful for improving our Teaching practices.	SD	16	9.14		
	D	20	11.4		
	N	25	14.2	2	1.178
	A	54	30.8		
	SA	60	34.8		

Table 25 demonstrates that 30.8% respondents were agree and also 34.8% strongly agree to the statement that inspection visits are useful, and std 1.178.

Table 26: Teacher absenteeism is a problem at this school.

Statement	Level	F	P%	Mode	Std/dv
	SD	22	12.5		

Teacher	D	13	7.4		
Absenteeism is	N	28	16	3	1.192
Problem at this	A	57	32.5		
School.	SA	55	31.4		

Table 26 demonstrates that 32.5% respondents were agree and also 31.4% strongly agree to the statement that teacher absenteeism is problem in school. Std, 1.192.

Table 27: There are too many children in the class for one teacher

Statement	Level	F	P%	Mode	Std/dv
There are too Many children In the class for One teacher.	SD	9	5.1		
	D	11	6.2		
	N	18	10.2	2	1.146
	A	68	38.8		
	SA	69	39.4		

Table 27 demonstrates that 38.8% respondents were agreed and also 39.4% strongly agree to the statement that large number of children in the class. And, std, 1.14

Table 28: ECE training made me more punctual that leads to perform my professional duties well

Statement	Level	F	P%	Mode	Std/dv
ECE training made Made me more Punctual that leads to perform my professional duties well.	SD	10	5.7		
	D	12	6.8		
	N	16	9.1		1.124
	A	64	36.5	3	
	SA	73	41.7		

Table 28 demonstrates that 36.5% respondents were agree and also 41.7% strongly agree to the statement that through training teacher more punctual to perform professional duties.

Table 29: Teacher provide support to one another

Statement	Level	F	P%	Mode	Std/dv
Teacher provide Support to one Another.	SD	16	9.1		
	D	20	12.4		
	N	35	20		1.120
	A	51	29.1	1	

Table 29 demonstrates that 29.1% respondents were agree and also 30.2% strongly agree to the statement that teacher provide support to one another. Std, 1.120

Summary

In a developing country like Pakistan, Early Childhood Education program can be very influenced in achieving Education for All targets. The primary goal of this study was to evaluate in-service teaching methods at the ECE level. An analysis of these issues was performed to identify the training problem and recommend Measures in the form of proposed plans to deal with the problem. The study's objectives were to research impact of in-service training on teachers' performance at the ECE level, as well as to examine the training program in institutions to execute the ECE program in the specified schools. The study's purpose was to provide suggestions both the long- and short-term suggested approaches for district-level ECE program implementation. One questionnaire was designed for ECE teachers.

Before the research tools were used to gather data from study participants, they underwent validation.

The data acquired from the study's sample using research methods was interpreted and analyzed in light of the study's objectives.

Findings

Demographics

These results were reached by analyzing a survey for instructors.

Characteristics of respondents

1. Majority of respondents were female, that was 93, and secondly were Male that was 92.
2. Majority of respondents having M.A/MSc degree.
3. Majority of respondents fall under category 16-20 year experience and secondly category 6-10 years.

Part-2 Objective 1-To investigate the teacher training practices at ECE level

4. The majority of the participants demonstrate that 32% respondents were effective and 33.1% highly effective, So that result 65.1% were Effective to the statement that through training teacher know about different strategies at ECE level which shows that the Teachers have supported the statement. R score is 1.348. (Table 4)
5. Majority of the respondents demonstrate that 34.3% respondents were Effective and also 29.7% Highly Effective, So that the result 63.10% were Effective to the statement that through training teacher use practice books, phonics, other languages activities. R-s is 3.567. Which shows that the teachers have supported the statement. (Table 5)
6. Majority of the respondents demonstrate that 76% were Effective and 70% Highly Effective, 146% were Effective to the statement that through training teacher practice poem, math's

table, reading aloud. R-v is 1.122. which shows that the teachers have supported the statement. (Table 6)

7. Majority of the respondents demonstrate that 46.8% respondents were Effective and also 36.5% Highly Effective, So that the result 84.13 were Effective to the statement that through training teacher managed their class effectively. R-vis 1.130. which shows that the teachers have not supported the statement. (Table 7)
8. Majority of the respondents demonstrate that 40% respondents were Effective and also 35.4% Highly Effective, So that the result 74.4% was Effective to the statement that through training teacher used classroom material appropriately. R-v is 1.268. which shows that the teachers have supported the statement. (Table 8)
9. Majority of the respondents: demonstrate that 40% respondents were Effective and also 70% Highly Effective, So that the result 110% were Effective to the statement that through training teacher managed interactive classroom setting. R-v is 1.247 which shows that the teachers have supported the statement. (Table 9)
10. Majority of the respondents demonstrate that 46.8% respondents were Effective and also 36.5% Highly Effective, So that the result 84.13% were Effective to the statement that through training teacher prepared contingency plan for unexpected problem. R-vis 1.020 which shows that the teachers have supported the statement. (Table 10)
11. Majority of the respondent: demonstrate that 64% respondents were Effective and also 76% Highly Effective, So that the result 140 were Highly Effective to the statement that through training teacher mold the lesson according children need. R-v is 1.298 which show that the teachers have supported the statement. (Table 11)
12. Majority of the respondents demonstrate that 34.2% respondents were Effective and also 34.8% Highly Effective, So that the result 68.10% was Effective to the statement that through training teacher helps children in their developing skills. R-v is 1.130. Which show that the teachers have supported the statement. (Table 12)
13. Majority of the respondents, demonstrate that 38.8% respondents were Effective and also 38.8% Highly Effective, So that the result 76.16% were Effective to the statement that through training teacher helps children in tracing writing. R-v is 1.143. Which show that the teachers have supported the statement? (Table 13)
14. Majority of the respondents demonstrate that 41.7% respondents were Effective and also 43.4% Highly Effective, So that the result 84.11% were Effective to the statement that through training teacher interaction with parents to improve children learning effectively. R-s is 1.147. Which show that the teachers have supported the statement. (Table 14)
15. Majority of the respondents demonstrate that 29.1% respondents were Effective and also 34.2% Highly Effective, So that the result 63.3% was Effective to the statement that through training teacher copes with children different behavior. R-s is 1.130. Which show that the teachers have supported the statement. (Table 15)
16. Majority of the respondents demonstrate that 70% respondents were Effective and also 70% Highly Effective, So that the result 140% was Effective to the statement that through training

teacher more connected with children. R-vis 1.143. Which show that the teachers have supported the statement. (Table 16)

17. Majority of the respondents: demonstrate that 41.1% respondents Effective and 42.2 % Highly Effective, 83.3% were Effective to the statement that ECE training help teacher, to tackle those parents, who are not able to teach their children. R-v is 1.132. Which show that the teachers have supported the statement. (Table 17)
18. Majority of the respondents: demonstrate that 34.2% respondents were agree and also 32% Highly Effective, So that the result 66.2% were Effective to the statement that through training teacher helps children in tracing writing. R-v is 1.143. Which show that the teachers have supported the statement. (Table 18)

Summary of findings (objective-1)

In-Service training practices support the teacher to teach. In-Service training help teacher in using different strategies. In-Service training not a properly implement in the school, or In-Service training facilitate teacher for contingency plan, interaction with parents, children, tackle illiterate parents, who are not able to teach their children at home. In-Service training help teacher in developing methods. In-Service training improves practices to cope with children, in tracing writing, reciting poem, maths table, reading aloud books, It's not easy to monitor children progress through training practices work load.

Objective 2- to examine the training implementation program at ECE level.

19. Majority of the respondents demonstrate that 36.5% respondents were agree and also 37.1% strongly agree, So that the result 73.6% were agreed to the statement that available of art-kit materials for whole class is effective. Std 1.270 which show that the teachers have supported the statement. (Table 19)
20. Majority of the respondents demonstrate that 41.7% respondents were agree and also 41.7% strongly agree, So that the result 82.14 % were agreed to the statement that teacher pleased with the availability of basic facilities. Std 1.318. which show that the teachers have supported the statement. (Table 20)
21. Majority of the respondents demonstrate that 32% respondents were agree and also 36.5% strongly agree, So that the result 68.5% were agreed to the statement that teacher pleased with the availability of opportunities. Std, 1.114 which show that the teachers have supported the statement. (Table 21)
22. Majority of the respondents demonstrate that 28.5% respondents were agree and also 24% strongly agree, So that the result 52.5% were agreed to the statement that teacher pleased with the support from Head teacher. Std 1.311. Which show that the teachers have supported the statement. (Table 22)
23. Majority of the respondents demonstrate that 31.4% respondents were agree and also 38.8% strongly agree, So that the result 69.12% were agreed to the statement that Head teacher set example for teacher. Std 1.236. Which show that the teachers have supported the statement. (Table 23)
24. Majority of the respondents demonstrate that 32% respondents were agree and also 33.1%

strongly agree, So that the result 65.1% were agreed to the statement that head teacher regularly observes classes. Std 1.194 which show that the teachers have supported the statement. (Table 24)

25. Majority of the respondents demonstrate that 30.8% respondents were agree and also 34.8% strongly agree, So that the result 64.16% were agreed to the statement that inspection visits are useful, and std1.178. Which show that the teachers have supported the statement. (Table 25)
26. Majority of the respondents demonstrate that 32.5% respondents were agree and also 31.4% strongly agree, So that the result 63.9% were agreed to the statement that teacher absenteeism is problem in school. Std, 1.192. Which show that the teachers have supported the statement. (Table 26)
27. Majority of the respondents demonstrate that 38.8% respondents were agree and also 39.4% Strongly agree, 77.11% were agreed to the statement that large number of children in the class. And, std, 1.146 which show that the teachers have supported the statement. (Table 27)
28. Majority of the respondents demonstrate that 36.5% respondents were agree and also 41.7% strongly agree, So that the result 77.12% were agreed to the statement that through training teacher more punctual to perform professional duties, which show that the teachers have supported the statement. (Table 28)
29. Majority of the respondents demonstrate that 29.1% respondents were agree and also 30.2% strongly agree, So that the result 59.3% were agreed to the statement that teacher provide support to one another. Std, 1.120 which show that the teachers have supported the statement. (Table 29)

Summary of findings (objective-2)

In-Service training implementation programme support the teacher to use art-kit materials appropriately. In-Service training programme help teacher to support work on time, Head teacher support is very helpful, In-Service training programme provides different opportunities during training sessions, regular examine the classes, inspection visits are also useful. While the issues found, that teacher absenteeism, and large numbers of students in ne class, the other statement that teacher strictly performed duties, and also teacher provide support to one another is very helpful.

Discussion

RQ1. How the teacher practices can be effective teaching at ECE level in Chakwal public school?

The goal of this study was analyze ECE program in government schools in Tehsil Chakwal. The study's findings demonstrated that the ECE program in Chakwal was successfully executed. The study's sample included ECE teachers from 175 ECE schools selected for the ECE program. The population of the study 322 comprises the entire Tehsil Chakwal. Using a simple random technique, a random sample of 175 ECE qualified instructors was picked at random. Each school has one teacher. The purpose of the questionnaire was to gather quantitative data from ECE at-service instructors employed in ECE schools so that a comprehensive assessment of the Chakwal ECE program could be conducted. Information was gathered from ECE teachers. by District Teacher Educators (DTEs) and Teacher Educators (TEs) from the district training and support

center. The district educational administration was also active in gathering relevant data on time.

The researcher, on the other hand, traveled to the 28 school tehsil to collect quantitative data with a research tool. The data was acquired using the questionnaire survey method and analyzed using SPSS. The percentages scores and regression analysis were utilized, and the analysis was based on the opinions of teachers who teach at the ECE level. The study's findings showed that teachers' perceptions about In-Service training were better than average. Teacher agree that In-Service training increases their performance to teach at ECE level. Teachers concurred that In-Service training effectively optimizes class time. This study investigated that finding, evaluating, and gathering data from many sources is made possible by technology. Due to a significant network difficulty in the Tehsil Chakwal.

The majority of In-Service Teachers disagreed that training implementation not to be accessible whenever and wherever they wanted. The study examined the preference of teachers for In-Service training methodology over conventional ones. The study also provides art-kit materials that In-Service training practices for instruction enhances course quality and enables children to tracing writing, reciting poems, maths table, reading aloud books on their learning and development. This research investigates how many difficulties make tracking children progress at ECE level. Regarding the utilization or effectiveness of utilization of training practices, teacher tackle parents, children, classroom material appropriately managed successfully instructors' personal beliefs impact of In-Service training, ait (Lightner & Lightner-Laws, 2016; Qasem & Viswanathappa, 2016).

. Does the ECE programe planned can be benefited and helpful implemented in all govt schools of Tehsil Chakwal ?

- The researcher analyzed the materials relevant to the ECE while developing tools for data collection from the study's sample. The teachers assigned to the ECE program lacked the necessary degrees, certificates, and diplomas to teach at the ECE level. There were no further incentives provided by the government for ECE teachers to advance in their professions. The ECE teachers were chosen at random by the school heads, with no specific selection process. In order to properly care for the ECE children enrolled In Early Childhood Education levels and to assist ECE teachers, the caregivers assigned to the ECE program, required further training and competencies.
- The participation and interaction of school council members and parents was also inadequate, as was practiced by the program management during the execution of this ECE program. Due to increasing enrolment in ECE classes, The learning materials offered for the learning activities were insufficient to meet the criteria of the ECE school. ECE level classes were not properly served by specialized and unique classrooms. The government's ECE program was a promising start, but it needed a lot of work to offer basic amenities. The government must make significant planning efforts to boost the execution of the Early Childhood Education program in Chakwal.
- Hired agencies may be enrolled to satisfy the needs of the ways for the ECE level program, as they currently help various educational programs in Punjab Chakwal. The effective usage of elementary schools offers a further chance to boost the quantity of certified early childhood educators for ECE programs. Any initiative that incorporates members of the local community is tremendously beneficial. Degrees and diplomas in the discipline of ECE level are offered by teacher training institutions and other universities. This is another advantage for the ECE program in meeting their standards.

- One of the major issues confronting ECE level programs was the availability of financial resources for an ECE program based on the needs. The art-kit material is offered to children participating in ECE sessions. It is possible to give material that is activity-based. Another issue that the ECE implementation program faced was the customization of specialized ECE courses. The provision of suitable restroom facilities A real prerequisite for the ECE program was the school's ECE level. ECE and other pre-school programs are designed for children aged 3 to 5. Special interactive abilities in the form of several levels were employed to encourage parents to enroll their children in schools, One of the major issues confronting the ECE program's management was the appointment of ECE level teachers based on merit. Special attention should be paid to trained teachers and caregivers.
- Regular training sessions for heads and ECE teachers are required to ensure the educational effectiveness of this program. ECE-trained teachers should be appointed. When planning the curriculum for ECE education, basic prerequisites must be considered. As a result, financial sources of income can be raised and provided on an annual basis, roughly in line with the requirements. Physical activities in classrooms, restrooms, and playgrounds may be enhanced depending on the ECE children's age level. Competent educators selected for ECE positions based on their qualifications. It is important to schedule frequent training sessions for school officials and ECE teachers. The district educational administration should be trained in order to properly oversee the ECE level training sessions. Establishing the ECE program should be a collaborative effort between parents and members of the School Council.

Conclusions

The efficiency of the ECE program and its effects on children's learning capacities were investigated in this study. It was judged that ECE's current state was insufficient. There were some challenges in implementing the ECE program on the ground, A number of factors, including a lack of funding, access to physical and educational resources, and ongoing monitoring and assessment, have significantly impacted the ECE program's efficacy. There was only one primary school teacher, there were insufficient financial resources for the department, and the ECE training was not given priority by the department, among other problems that were found. Furthermore, government funding for the improvement of ECE programs was not successfully allocated because these ECE classes lacked all of the necessary teaching-learning art-kit supplies based on the needs of the children in the classroom. It was also revealed that for the ECE program to be successful, continual monitoring and assessment procedures are essential. Consequently, there is a significant positive influence of the ECE program's success on the performance of in-service teachers. This study used a survey to assess the program's performance. However, a questionnaire instrument can be used to investigate the impact of trainings. A quantitative methods research strategy, on the other hand, can yield more detailed and thorough data. The purpose of the current study is to evaluate the effectiveness of an in-service ECE teacher training program for government schools in Chakwal. Through the use of the theoretical framework in the early childhood education field in Chakwal, it will add to knowledge. It will also be a source of awareness among donors on the use of their funds in the ECE level. This study will also open a new path for future researchers. There can be done more research-based on the present research. It was concluded that impact of in-service training on teachers performance teaching at ECE level was quite well. Their impact on teaching performance at the ECE level and the development of teaching strategies was positive during in-service training. It was also stated that the in-service training program's short and long term analyses increased teaching capabilities and moderated their technique.

Recommendations

Following consideration of the questionnaire data, these recommendations were developed.

1. A short-term and long-term action plan must be developed by the government in order to accomplish the objective of the ECE program. Increasing ECE availability and resolving implementation challenges ought to be the main priorities.
2. The growth of the ECE program and its application in the public sector depend heavily on infrastructure development. Funding provisions specific to the establishment of distinctive early childhood education courses that are well-equipped for both learning and physical exercise should be made.
3. Governments should establish a distinct cadre of ECE professors with the required credentials and training in order to enhance ECE education in Pakistan. Additionally, the government ought to regularly offer pre-service and in-service training to promote a pleasant learning environment. To keep teachers up to date on the ECE program, refresher courses built on cutting-edge teaching techniques and approaches ought to be offered.
4. To keep a positive learning atmosphere and finish mainstreaming the ECE program, the government should set up an efficient monitoring and assessment mechanism. Pakistan's ECE program might be monitored to see how it is being implemented and developed.
5. To raise public knowledge of the value of early childhood education (ECE) in Pakistan, the government, non-governmental organizations (NGOs), and private educational institutions should launch public awareness campaigns.

It is imperative that all parties involved in Pakistan acknowledge the importance of early childhood education. It is important to use forums, conferences, seminars, and the media to spread awareness of important ECE issues.

Suggestions for Future Research

The study will be beneficial for different stakeholders i.e. policy makers, QAED management, donor agencies and pre-service teachers' education departments. The present study will help the QAED management, school education, school education departments as well as Govt. of Punjab to better plan their training program of ECE. The Punjab Staff Development Directorate is in charge of the initiative, which was started by the Punjabi government. The literature on the management of ECE programs was also examined by the researcher. Care givers were assigned to supervise the ECE students and assist the teachers during the teaching process.

This program will also be monitored by an effective monitoring system. Students enrolled in the ECE program saw improvements in their mental and cognitive development. The ECE program stresses play and physical activity as methods of increasing children' interest in schools and learning activities while being supervised by qualified teachers. Students in the ECE program become ready for formal education. They range in age from three to five initiative launched by the Punjabi government and overseen by the Punjabi Directorate of Staff Development. The literature on the administration of ECE programs was also examined by the researcher. Before the researcher's development, a sizable number of theses, books, papers, and articles were reviewed by the researcher.

References

1. Bleach, J. (2014). Developing professionalism through reflective practice and ongoing professional development. *European Early Childhood Education Research Journal*, 22(2), 185-197. <https://doi.org/10.1080/1350293X.2014.883719>
2. Chen, Y.-L. (2023). The practice of reflection in early childhood teachers' work: Evidence from reflection-for-, in-, and on-action. *Reflective Practice*, 24(2), 190–206. <https://doi.org/10.1080/14623943.2023.2194624>
3. Cherrington, S. (2018). Thinking about teaching: Early childhood teachers' thinking and reflection as they talk about their teaching. *Early Years*, 38(3), 271–285. <https://doi.org/10.1080/09575146.2016.1259211>
4. Cigala, A., Venturelli, G., & Bassetti, C. (2019). A longitudinal training for educators in early childhood education and care centres: Effects on their perceived self-efficacy, sense of belonging, and agency. *Frontiers in Psychology*, 10, 2574. <https://doi.org/10.3389/fpsyg.2019.02574>
5. Han, H. S., Blank, J., & Berson, I. R. (2020). Reforming early childhood teacher education in the policy context: A self-study of teacher educators. *Journal of Early Childhood Teacher Education*, 41(4), 306–324. <https://doi.org/10.1080/10901027.2019.1632993>
6. Mahnaz, W., & Kiran, S., (2024a). Big Five Personality Traits and Social Network Sites Preferences: The Mediating Role of Academic performance in Educational Outcomes of Secondary School Students, *Social Science Review Archives*, 2 (2), 1353-1370 <https://doi.org/10.70670/sra.v2i2.187>
7. Mahnaz, W., & Kiran, S., (2024b). Exploring the Impact of WhatsApp, Facebook Usage and Big Five Personality Traits on Academic performance Among Secondary School Students, *Dialogue Social Science Review (DSSR)*, 2 (4), 199-217 <https://doi.org/10.5281/zenodo.14280812>
8. Mahnaz, W., & Kiran, S., (2024c). Personality-Driven Adoption of WhatsApp and Facebook for Educational Collaboration: Academic Performance as a Mediator, *Social Science Review Archives*, 2 (2), 1461-1473, DOI: <https://doi.org/10.70670/sra.v2i2.198>
9. Mahnaz, W., Gulzar, Bibi, S., & Ullah, S., (2025). The Influence of Flipped Classroom Pedagogy on Academic Achievement of Students at Higher Secondary Level: Usages of Social Network Sites as a Key Mediator, *Social Science Review Archives*, 3 (1), 1056-1070, DOI: <https://doi.org/10.70670/sra.v3i1.387>
10. Mahnaz, W., Gulzar, Bibi, S., & Ullah, S., (2025). The Influence of Flipped Classroom Pedagogy on Academic Achievement of Students at Higher Secondary Level: Usages of Social Network Sites as a Key Mediator, *Social Science Review Archives*, 3 (1), 1056-1070, DOI: <https://doi.org/10.70670/sra.v3i1.387>
11. Mahnaz, W., Kiran, S., Mehmood, U., Arif, S., & Taqadees, N. (2023). Effects of Regular Monitoring of Monitoring Evaluation Assistan (MEAs) on The Quality of Schools: A Case Study of Tehsil Jand District Attock, Punjab, *Journal of Positive School Psychology* 7 (6), 967-980, <http://journalppw.com>
12. Mahnaz, W., Mehmood, U., Mehrukh, N., & Shaheen, A. (2022). Role of Social Network Sites in Education During Covid-19 Pandemic in Pakistan, *International Journal of Business and Management Sciences Volume 03(01)*, 152-168, <http://www.ijbms.org>
13. Mahnaz, W., Shah, M., N., Muhammad, N., Syed, Z., & Anjum, F. (2022). Self Esteem And Academic Performance Of Students In Public Secondary Schools In Punjab District Attock, *Journal of Positive School Psychology*6 (10), 3020-3033, <http://journalppw.com>

14. Recchia, S. L., & Beck, L. M. (2014). Reflective practice and professional development: Insights from young early childhood teachers. *Journal of Early Childhood Teacher Education*, 35(3), 240–252. <https://doi.org/10.1080/10901027.2014.936074>
15. Shea, S. E., Goldberg, S., & Weatherston, D. J. (2018). A community mental health training program: Impact on early childhood interventionists' perceptions of self-efficacy, job satisfaction, and job stress. *Infant Mental Health Journal*, 39(1), 77–86. <https://doi.org/10.1002/imhj.21693>
16. Syslová, Z. (2019). The relation between reflection and the quality of a preschool teacher's education performance. *International Journal of Child Care and Education Policy*, 13(4). <https://doi.org/10.1186/s40723-019-0060-y>
17. Venninen, T., Leinonen, J., Ojala, M., & Lipponen, L. (2012). Creating Conditions for Reflective Practice in Early Childhood Education. *International Journal of Child Care and Education Policy*, 6(1), 1–15. <https://doi.org/10.1007/2288-6729-6-1>
18. White, S., & Lam, T. (2023). Digital storytelling as reflective practice: Supporting migrant and refugee children's sense of belonging in early childhood settings. *Early Childhood Education Journal*, 51(3), 487–499. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10643-023-01538-z>
19. ZERO TO THREE. (2024). Buzzwords Explained: Reflective Practice. <https://www.zerotothree.org/resource/distillation/buzzwords-explained-reflective-practice/>